



nikmatur rohmah <nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id>

BMJ Open - Decision on Manuscript ID bmjopen-2022-064532

1 pesan

BMJ Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

10 Oktober 2022 pukul 19.54

Balas Ke: info.bmjopen@bmj.com

Kepada: ratna-d-w@fkm.unair.ac.id

bmjopen-2022-064532 - "Regional disparities in hospital utilization in Indonesia: A population study in 2018"

Dear Dr. Wulandari,

Following review of your article to BMJ Open, we invite you to submit a major revision.

The review comments can be found at the end of this email, together with any comments from the Editorial Office regarding formatting changes or additional information required to meet the journal's policies at this time.

Please note that your revision may be subject to further review and that this initial decision does not guarantee acceptance.

To submit your revised article please click this link: *** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmjopen?URL_MASK=b7d1436d94ef44e5b44504b7231eedbb. Alternatively, you can log on to your Author Dashboard in ScholarOne and under "Action" click "create a revision".

Please read and respond to all of the editorial and peer review comments. You should provide a point-by-point response to explain any changes you have (or have not) made to the original article and be as specific as possible in your responses.

The original files will be available to you when you start your revision. Please delete any files that you intend to replace with updated versions and upload the following using the appropriate file designation:

- "Main Document" - This is a clean copy (without tracked or highlighted changes) of your revised article. Please delete your original submission file.
- "Main Document - marked copy" - This is the edited version of your original article, including edits to address the peer review comments. Any changes have been highlighted using a track change function or bold or coloured text. Please replace any other files that have been updated e.g. Images, forms.

The reviewers' comments, your response, and the previous versions of your article will be published as supplementary information alongside the final version of your article.

Information relating to your article, including author names and affiliations, title, abstract and required statements (e.g. competing interests, contributorship, funding) will be taken directly from the information held in ScholarOne, and not from the article file. Please check that this information has been entered correctly and has been updated as appropriate. If your revised article is accepted, you will only be able to make minor changes (e.g. correction of typesetting errors and proof stage) prior to publication.

Please submit your revised article by 09-Nov-2022. If you have not submitted by this date, or would like an extension, please email our Editorial Office.

Thank you for submitting your article to BMJ Open; we look forward to receiving your revision.

If you have any queries, please contact the Editorial Office at info.bmjopen@bmj.com.

Kind regards,

Neil Bennet
Research Editor
BMJ Open

*** **

Editor(s)' Comments to the Authors:

*Please work to improve the quality of the English throughout your manuscript. We recommend asking a native English-speaking colleague to assist you or to enlist the help of a professional copy-editing service.

*Please update the article title to include a clearer description of the study design and data source. Eg, "Regional disparities in hospital utilization in Indonesia: an analysis of cross-sectional data from the 2018 Indonesian Basic Health Survey" (or similar).

*Please delete the 'Ethics' section of the abstract (this information is already present in the main text and is not part of the abstract requirements)

*Please revise final bullet point of the 'Strengths and limitations of this study' section so that it consists of one sentence rather than two (eg, through use of a semi-colon or brackets).

*Please update the main text Methods section to ensure all necessary details of the survey sampling procedures are reported - eg, on what factors/variables was the same weighted and using what methods? Is there a known response rate for the survey?

** **

Reviewer: 1

I.T. Peres , Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro

Comments to the Author:

The authors analyzed socio-demographic factors related to hospital utilization in Indonesia using a large cohort of adult individuals. The results indicate a lower use of resources for the poorest people, with low education, no insurance, and living in rural regions. However, the text is more focused on exposing regional disparities. I suggest focusing more on the other socio-demographic factors related to hospital utilization, indicating that socially vulnerable individuals tend to have worse access to health facilities in Indonesia. The discussion should be revised, including other articles that investigated socio-demographic factors related to hospital utilization.

Other comments:

- The abstract should be revised. The results should resume the main results of the article and not just show the AOR of each region. It should summarize the important results of the socio-demographic factors.
- The title could be more related to "socio-demographic factors" and not just the regional disparities.

Reviewer: 2

Juan Gervas Camacho, Equipo CESCA - Madrid, Sp

Comments to the Author:

The text describes a reality that is true in all countries as health resources are inequitably distributed.

The needs of remote, rural and sparsely populated areas are always poorly met.

The text should be reduced in length and made more specific.

It would be key to describe access to primary and hospital care according to cost (e.g. co-payment).

The possible demand induced by hospitals should also be mentioned. It is not just a question of receiving hospital services, but also of whether they are necessary. We do not know the optimal volume of care, and we are unable to say whether or not the additional care provided was in the best interest of the patients.

See:

Evans, R. G. (1974). Supplier-induced demand: Some empirical evidence and implications." Chapter 10. In M. Perlman (Ed.), The economics of health and medical care. New York: Macmillan.

The theory of physician-induced demand: reflections after a decade <https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/abs/pii/S0167629685900086?via%3Dihub>

Competition and physician-induced demand in a healthcare market with regulated price: evidence from Ghana. <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10754-021-09320-7>

Un saludo Juan Gervas, MD, PhD, retired rural general practitioner, ex-professor public health Johns Hopkins University. Equipo CESCA, Madrid, Spain

*** **

COI statements:

Reviewer: 1

Competing interests of Reviewer: None.

Reviewer: 2

Competing interests of Reviewer: No competing interests at all.



nikmatur rohmah <nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id>

BMJ Open - Manuscript ID bmjopen-2022-064532.R1

2 pesan

BMJ Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

14 Oktober 2022 pukul 07.32

Balas Ke: info.bmjopen@bmj.com

Kepada: agung.dwi.laksono@brin.go.id, ratna-d-w@fkm.unair.ac.id, nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id, rukm007@brin.go.id, tuma001@brin.go.id

14-Oct-2022

Dear Dr. Wulandari:

Your manuscript entitled "Regional disparities in hospital utilization in Indonesia: An analysis of cross-sectional data from the 2018 Indonesian Basic Health Survey" has been successfully submitted online and is presently being given full consideration for publication in BMJ Open.

Your manuscript ID is bmjopen-2022-064532.R1.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to ScholarOne Manuscripts at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmjopen> and edit your user information as appropriate.

Author names will be taken directly from the information held in ScholarOne and not from the article file. Please check that all names are correctly entered as this will be the name displayed on the final published article and in any indexes affiliated with the journal.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmjopen>.

Any individuals listed as co-authors on this manuscript are copied into this submission confirmation email. If you believe that you have received this email in error, please contact the Editorial Office.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to BMJ Open.

Kind regards,

Editor in Chief, BMJ Open

P.s. What did you think of the article submission process?

At BMJ, we constantly strive to improve our services for authors. We value your feedback and we'd be grateful if could take 5 minutes to fill out our short survey. Your responses will remain confidential and you won't be identified in any results.

Please click on this link to access the survey: <https://www.surveymonkey.co.uk/r/6DGV97V>

We are constantly trying to find ways of improving our peer review system and continually monitor processes and methods by including article submissions and reviewers' reports in our research. If you do not wish your paper or review entered into our peer review research programme, please let us know by emailing papersadmin@bmj.com as soon as possible.

BMJ Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

14 Oktober 2022 pukul 15.37

Balas Ke: info.bmjopen@bmj.com

Kepada: agung.dwi.laksono@brin.go.id, ratna-d-w@fkm.unair.ac.id, nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id, rukm007@brin.go.id, tuma001@brin.go.id

[Kutipan teks disembunyikan]



nikmatur rohmah <nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id>

BMJ Open - Manuscript ID bmjopen-2022-064532.R1

1 pesan

BMJ Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

17 Oktober 2022 pukul 14.38

Balas Ke: info.bmjopen@bmj.com

Kepada: agung.dwi.laksono@brin.go.id, ratna-d-w@fkm.unair.ac.id, nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id, rukm007@brin.go.id, tuma001@brin.go.id

17-Oct-2022

Dear Dr. Wulandari:

Your manuscript entitled "Regional disparities in hospital utilization in Indonesia: An analysis of cross-sectional data from the 2018 Indonesian Basic Health Survey" has been successfully submitted online and is presently being given full consideration for publication in BMJ Open.

Your manuscript ID is bmjopen-2022-064532.R1.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to ScholarOne Manuscripts at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmjopen> and edit your user information as appropriate.

Author names will be taken directly from the information held in ScholarOne and not from the article file. Please check that all names are correctly entered as this will be the name displayed on the final published article and in any indexes affiliated with the journal.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmjopen>.

Any individuals listed as co-authors on this manuscript are copied into this submission confirmation email. If you believe that you have received this email in error, please contact the Editorial Office.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to BMJ Open.

Kind regards,

Editor in Chief, BMJ Open

P.s. What did you think of the article submission process?

At BMJ, we constantly strive to improve our services for authors. We value your feedback and we'd be grateful if could take 5 minutes to fill out our short survey. Your responses will remain confidential and you won't be identified in any results.

Please click on this link to access the survey: <https://www.surveymonkey.co.uk/r/6DGV97V>

We are constantly trying to find ways of improving our peer review system and continually monitor processes and methods by including article submissions and reviewers' reports in our research. If you do not wish your paper or review entered into our peer review research programme, please let us know by emailing papersadmin@bmj.com as soon as possible.



nikmatur rohmah <nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id>

BMJ Open - Decision on Manuscript ID bmjopen-2022-064532.R1

1 pesan

BMJ Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

11 November 2022 pukul 23.44

Balas Ke: info.bmjopen@bmj.com

Kepada: ratna-d-w@fkm.unair.ac.id

bmjopen-2022-064532.R1 - "Regional disparities in hospital utilization in Indonesia: An analysis of cross-sectional data from the 2018 Indonesian Basic Health Survey"

Dear Dr. Wulandari,

Following re-review of your revised article submitted to BMJ Open, we invite you to submit a further revision.

The review comments can be found at the end of this email, together with any comments from the Editorial Office regarding formatting changes or additional information required to meet the journal's policies at this time.

Please note that your revision may be subject to further review and that this initial decision does not guarantee acceptance.

To submit your revised article please click this link: *** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmjopen?URL_MASK=3c1d02aff9fa4b09a2342a78355a1d3b. Alternatively, you can log on to your Author Dashboard in ScholarOne and under "Action" click "create a revision".

Please read and respond to all of the editorial and peer review comments. You should provide a point-by-point response to explain any changes you have (or have not) made to the original article and be as specific as possible in your responses.

The original files will be available to you when you start your revision. Please delete any files that you intend to replace with updated versions and upload the following using the appropriate file designation:

- "Main Document" - This is a clean copy (without tracked or highlighted changes) of your revised article. Please delete your original submission file.
- "Main Document - marked copy" - This is the edited version of your original article, including edits to address the peer review comments. Any changes have been highlighted using a track change function or bold or coloured text. Please replace any other files that have been updated e.g. Images, forms.

The reviewers' comments, your response, and the previous versions of your article will be published as supplementary information alongside the final version of your article.

Information relating to your article, including author names and affiliations, title, abstract and required statements (e.g. competing interests, contributorship, funding) will be taken directly from the information held in ScholarOne, and not from the article file. Please check that this information has been entered correctly and has been updated as appropriate. If your revised article is accepted, you will only be able to make minor changes (e.g. correction of typesetting errors and proof stage) prior to publication.

Please submit your revised article by 27-Nov-2022. If you have not submitted by this date, or would like an extension, please email our Editorial Office.

Thank you for submitting your article to BMJ Open; we look forward to receiving your revision.

If you have any queries, please contact the Editorial Office at info.bmjopen@bmj.com.

Kind regards,

Neil Bennet
Research Editor
BMJ Open

*** **

Editor(s)' Comments to the Authors:

*Please add a section to the abstract, entitled either 'Outcome measures' or 'Methods', immediately before the Results section. This new section should include summary information on the outcomes and analyses done in the present study.

*Please carefully revise the 'Results' section of the abstract to make it less repetitive and easier to read. Please also be careful to ensure that the language used is appropriate and clear (for example, for the sentence on Maluku region, "0.827 times less likely" makes no sense (as being less than 1, the number already indicates 'less', so using the word 'less' does not make sense). We would suggest the following:

"Someone in the Sumatra region was 1.079 times (95% CI 1.073-1.085) more likely than someone in the Papua region to utilize the hospital (95% CI 1.073-1.085). Also compared with the Papua region, those in the Java-Bali region (1.075 times, 95% CI 1.069-1.081), Nusa Tenggara region (1.106 times, 95% CI 1.099-1.113), Sulawesi region (1.008 times, 95% CI 1.002-1.014), and Kalimantan region (1.212 times, 95% CI 1.205-1.219) were more likely to utilize the hospital. However, someone in the Maluku region was only 0.827 (95% CI 0.820-0.835) times as likely as someone in the Papua region to utilize the hospital."

Please check the main text for any similar issues and revise accordingly.

*Please also revise the final sentence of the 'Results' section of the abstract (the sentence starting 'The study also found six demographic variables') to include numerical data, including measures of statistical significance, to support the statements in this sentence.

*Please revise the final bullet point in the 'Strengths and limitations of this study' section (after the abstract) so that it consists of one sentence rather than two.

*Please simplify the 'Patient and public involvement' statement to read "None." and please move the 'Patient and public involvement' statement to after the 'Ethical Approval' section.

*Please revise table 2 so that P values are on the right-hand side of the table (ie, after the AORs and CIs rather than before).

*Please work to further improve the quality of the English throughout your manuscript. We strongly recommend asking a native English-speaking colleague to assist you or to enlist the help of a professional copy-editing service.

** **

Reviewer: 2

Juan Gervas Camacho, Equipo CESCA - Madrid, Sp

Comments to the Author:

The paper is now better.

Perhaps you could synthesise the results of the summary as:

The results show that someone in the Sumatra, the Java-Bali, the Nusa Tenggara and the Sulawesi region is more than 1.000 times more likely than someone in the Papua region to use the hospital (95% CI 1.002-1.014). Someone in the Kalimantan region is 1.212 times more likely than someone in the Papua region to use the hospital (95% CI 1.205-1.219). [NOTE FROM THE EDITORS: We are unsure about the suggested wording, as "more than 1.000 times more likely" is a confusing phrase, since more than 1 times is just the definition of an increase. Please consider this in responding to this comment and ensure your edits are appropriate and clear (please also refer to the editors' comments above, which should help to address the same issue)]

Reviewer: 1

I.T. Peres, Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro

Comments to the Author:

The authors made the requested revisions, and the article is almost ready for publication. Although they did not send a letter explaining the revisions made, it was possible to assess from the revised article that the necessary changes were implemented.

I have small issues that can be addressed for the final version of the paper:

- Figure 1 is not in the text. Please include. [Note from the editors: please rebut this comment - we require figures be provided in separate files only, not included in the main manuscript document]
- Table 2 could be better formatted. It could have a new column with the variable name separately and the other would be the variable class.
- Rephrase the following text ("provided to provide"): "Frequency weights are provided to provide numbers that reflect the actual population nationally. Finally, the survey collected data with a response rate of 93.20% for individual targets and 95.58% for household targets."
- The discussion should be improved with more socio-demographic references.

*** **

COI statements:

Reviewer: 2

Competing interests of Reviewer: No competing interests at all.

Reviewer: 1

Competing interests of Reviewer: None.



nikmatur rohmah <nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id>

BMJ Open - Manuscript ID bmjopen-2022-064532.R2

1 pesan

BMJ Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>

22 November 2022 pukul 09.18

Balas Ke: info.bmjopen@bmj.com

Kepada: agung.dwi.laksono@brin.go.id, ratna-d-w@fkm.unair.ac.id, nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id, rukm007@brin.go.id, tuma001@brin.go.id

22-Nov-2022

Dear Dr. Wulandari:

Your manuscript entitled "Regional disparities in hospital utilization in Indonesia: An analysis of cross-sectional data from the 2018 Indonesian Basic Health Survey" has been successfully submitted online and is presently being given full consideration for publication in BMJ Open.

Your manuscript ID is bmjopen-2022-064532.R2.

Please mention the above manuscript ID in all future correspondence or when calling the office for questions. If there are any changes in your street address or e-mail address, please log in to ScholarOne Manuscripts at <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmjopen> and edit your user information as appropriate.

Author names will be taken directly from the information held in ScholarOne and not from the article file. Please check that all names are correctly entered as this will be the name displayed on the final published article and in any indexes affiliated with the journal.

You can also view the status of your manuscript at any time by checking your Author Center after logging in to <https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/bmjopen>.

Any individuals listed as co-authors on this manuscript are copied into this submission confirmation email. If you believe that you have received this email in error, please contact the Editorial Office.

Thank you for submitting your manuscript to BMJ Open.

Kind regards,

Editor in Chief, BMJ Open

P.s. What did you think of the article submission process?

At BMJ, we constantly strive to improve our services for authors. We value your feedback and we'd be grateful if could take 5 minutes to fill out our short survey. Your responses will remain confidential and you won't be identified in any results.

Please click on this link to access the survey: <https://www.surveymonkey.co.uk/r/6DGV97V>

We are constantly trying to find ways of improving our peer review system and continually monitor processes and methods by including article submissions and reviewers' reports in our research. If you do not wish your paper or review entered into our peer review research programme, please let us know by emailing papersadmin@bmj.com as soon as possible.



nikmatur rohmah <nikmaturrohmah@unmuhjember.ac.id>

Your submission to BMJ Open has been accepted

1 pesan

BMJ Open <onbehalf@manuscriptcentral.com>
Balas Ke: info.bmjopen@bmj.com
Kepada: ratna-d-w@fkm.unair.ac.id

23 November 2022 pukul 18.59

23-Nov-2022

bmjopen-2022-064532.R2 - Regional disparities in hospital utilization in Indonesia: an analysis of cross-sectional data from the 2018 Indonesian Basic Health Survey

Dear Dr. Wulandari:

We are pleased to accept your article for publication in BMJ Open.

Within 2-3 working days, you will receive an email with payment options and instructions from BMJ's e-commerce partner, Copyright Clearance Center. You will be able to choose either to pay by credit card or invoice. If you are not making the payment yourself, you may forward the email to the person or organisation that will be paying on your behalf. Your article will not be processed by production until you have paid the article processing charge or requested an invoice. For more details on open access publication please visit our Author Hub: <https://authors.bmj.com/open-access/>.

Please note, that if your institution is part of one of BMJ's Publish and Read or prepay agreements your request for funding will be automatically processed based on this acceptance and you will only receive an email accepting or denying your funding request. To find out if your institution is part of a Publish and Read or prepay agreement visit BMJ's open access agreements page: <https://authors.bmj.com/open-access/institutional-programme/>.

Once payment is confirmed and your article is sent to Production, copyediting and typesetting will be completed. We will email you a proof to check via our online tool usually within 10-15 days of this time; please check your junk mail folder.

The proof is your opportunity to check for typesetting errors and the completeness and accuracy of the edited text; including author names and affiliations, tables and figures; including legends, numerical, mathematical, or other scientific expressions. We ask that you only make minor corrections at this stage. Please provide any comments within 48 hours. There will be no further opportunities to make corrections prior to publication.

See <https://authors.bmj.com/after-submitting/accepted/> for more information about what to expect once your article has been accepted.

We publish most articles online in their final form around three weeks after acceptance. See <https://authors.bmj.com/after-submitting/online-publication/> for more information about online publication. BMJ will deposit your article in all indexes affiliated with the journal.

If your article is selected for press release by BMJ's Press Office you will be informed as soon as possible.

If you have any queries, please contact the Editorial Office at info.bmjopen@bmj.com.

Kind regards,

Neil Bennet
Research Editor
BMJ Open

<https://bmjopen.bmj.com/>