

PAPER NAME

AUTHOR

8_Heru CAHYONO_2576-2587_JEMT Iss ue 6(70) Fall 2023.pdf **Nursaid Nursaid**

WORD COUNT

CHARACTER COUNT

8543 Words

48091 Characters

PAGE COUNT

FILE SIZE

12 Pages

274.4KB

SUBMISSION DATE

REPORT DATE

Dec 27, 2023 8:00 AM GMT+7

Dec 27, 2023 8:00 AM GMT+7

6% Overall Similarity

The combined total of all matches, including overlapping sources, for each database.

- 5% Internet database
- Crossref database
- 2% Submitted Works database

- 2% Publications database
- · Crossref Posted Content database

Excluded from Similarity Report

- · Bibliographic material
- Cited material
- Manually excluded sources

- · Quoted material
- Small Matches (Less then 15 words)





DOI: https://doi.org/10.14505/jemt.v14.6(70).08

Halal Tourism Campaign: Does It Demolish Conventional? A New Touristic Segment on the Island of Lombok

Heru CAHYONO

Universitas Islam Bunga Bangsa, Indonesia

ORCID: 0000-0002-8530-4657; Researcher ID: IZE-8487-2023

heru_cahyono_se@yahoo.com

Muh FAHRURROZI

Universitas Hamzanwadi, Indonesia

ORCID: 0000-0002-4402-4384; Researcher ID: AAV-5901-2020

fahrurrozi@hamzanwadi.ac.id

Toto SUKARNOTO

Universitas Islam Bunga Bangsa, Indonesia

ORCID: 0009-0003-2022-4941; Researcher ID: IZE-8448-2023

toto4sukarnoto@gmail.com

NURSAID

Universitas Muhammadiyah Jember, Indonesia

ORCID: 0000-0002-5396-9953; Researcher ID: IZP-7703-2023

nursaid@unmuhjember.ac.id

2 rticle info: Received 14 May 2023; Received in revised form 5 June 2023; Accepted 24 July 2023; Published 01 September 2023. Copyright© 2023 The Author(s). Published by ASERS Publishing 2023. This is an open access article distributed under the terms of CC-BY 4.0 license.

well-being improvement. The continuously growing Muslim population worldwide generates optimism that halal tourism is projected to be intensely consumed as it targets Muslims and non-Muslim travelers. This research then highlights how the halal tourism campaign impacts the existence of the conventional tourism industry on the island of Lombok. Phenomenology is a type of research formulated to answer research questions as it describes a phenomenon occurring at the research location. Processed data were systematically sourced from the first party in the form of structured interviews and participant observations involving hotel managers, government officials, tourism actors, academics, and related figures who fully understand the practice of halal tourism. Secondary sources (library research, document review) are analyzed in favor of the information sought. The study's results revealed that halal tourism practices are an added value to existing segments and can be adopted by non-Muslim tourism entrepreneurs. Halal tourism does not threaten conventional tourism, but its existence adds value to old products. Some challenges in response to halal tourism practice are discussed in this paper.

Keywords: conventional tourism; halal tourism; touristic segment.

JEL Classification: A12; L53;

Introduction

The acceleration of the tourism industry means the same opportunities that are increasingly open to the enhancement of societies' well-being. This phenomenon is consciously believed to bring economic benefits (Basri *et al.* 2020; Pan *et al.* 2018) to local communities in line with the increasing convenience of accessibility and recreational resources (Wang *et al.* 2020). The strength of tourism as *a lucrative venture*, with the most rapid development in the world (Cavallaro *et al.* 2017), has made a significant contribution to creating jobs (Groizard and Santana-Gallego 2018, Jia and Chaozhi 2021) and also reduces poverty rates (Qin *et al.* 2019).

The increasing growth of tourism in various provinces in Indonesia is currently receiving serious attention. Lombok, as one of *Indonesia's* tourist icons besides Bali, has succeeded in attracting three million tourists per year (BPS 2017) with a varied typology despite having experienced a decline due to natural disasters, earthquakes in 2018 (Ramdani *et al.* 2019). The government's concentration on building a tourist-friendly tourism image is a measurable way of reaching the market. Increasing the frequency of visits through optimization of the marketing mix has a better impact on the socio-economic community. Therefore, providing a variety of tourist segments is one of the critical variables for regional revenues (Yen *et al.* 2021), for example, hotel tax revenues, restaurant taxes, entertainment taxes, recreational and sports venue levies.

The trend of halal tourism as an alternative segmentation is not new, as it has been practiced in several Muslim and non-Muslim countries. The development of halal tourism continues to increase (Ainin *et al.* 2020; Slamet *et al.* 2022), and it is considered very important to read as a new force because it can create added value economically. The flow of Muslim tourist visits, especially middle eastern tourists, continues to increase because, historically, the offer of services and products that are friendly to Islamic values has caused an increase in interest in halal tourism (Yousaf and Xiucheng 2018). A significant shift in Muslim visits from major destinations such as the UK and Europe to Asia is an excellent opportunity for halal tourism. Essential factors such as the growth of the Muslim population, which continues to increase yearly (Carboni and Idrissi Janati 2016, Nurdiansyah 2018), are projected to grow globally. Over the next two decades, approximately twice the number of the non-Muslim population can also boost the halal segment.

Interestingly, countries that are members of the non-OIC (Non-Organization of Islamic Conference) have publicly declared themselves to accommodate this potential. South Korea, with its certification institutions, has formed halal organizations such as the Korean Muslim Federation (KMF) and the Korean Halal Association (KHA) as recognized legality (Satriana and Faridah 2018). In addition, Japan, under the Japan Halal Association (JHA) organization, won the title of "World Best Non-OIC (Organization of Islamic Conference) Emerging Halal Destination" in 2016.

In the context of halal tourism, Indonesia can become a pioneer country (Widagdyo 2015) in campaigning for halal tourism. Countries with a majority Muslim population in the world can representatively implement it, not just emerge as consumers filling the market. On the other hand, Muslim countries such as Malaysia, under The Department of Islamic Development Malaysia (JAKIM), have succeeded in creating a halal certification authority body that provides certification to more than 20 categories of products and services (Department of Islamic Development Malaysia; Daganghalal) (Moshin *et al.* 2020) while Indonesia is still just starting out.

In response to the enormous halal tourism market opportunity, various countries seized this opportunity by building halal-friendly infrastructure (Samori *et al.* 2016), including the island of Lombok. Under the provincial government, the island of Lombok has publicly declared itself to welcome halal tourism. Scholars agree that halal tourism is a significant opportunity to escalate economic growth (El-Gohary 2016). The chances of successful development of this type of tourism are based on logical considerations. First, the halal concept follows the sociocultural situation of the Lombok people with the Muslim majority. Second, the fertile religious value in social interaction makes the island of Lombok a friendly tourist destination for visitors. Third, public amenities such as restaurants that provide 100% halal food menu options can increase Muslim tourists' confidence in the legality of the food consumed. Places of worship in shopping centers, tourist destinations, or airports are also easily accessible (Subarkah 2018). The support of the icon "a thousand mosques" potentially develops the island of Lombok. Since the development of halal tourism, Lombok Island has been named the world's best halal tourism destination by the world halal travel summit and the best honeymoon destination at the international tourism award event (Waryono 2022).

Although some researchers have conducted studies on halal issues, the majority of the scope of their research still does not discuss much of what we are assessing; whether halal tourism will eliminate conventional tourism practices or not. The existing literature talks a lot about halal food and its certification as an offer to Muslim travelers (Henderson 2016) but does not discuss the possibility of halal tourism demolishing the conventional tourism industry. Other studies, such as the analysis of accommodation providers' websites (Razzaq et al. 2016), also the analysis of conflicts of halal attributes, elaborated on the impact on the psychology of visitors to make a return visit (Akhtar et al. 2020). Moreover, risk assessments of halal products and services (Olya and Al-ansi 2018) do not widely share findings on the specific idea of what is proposed in the research question. Almost the same research has been studied by (Battour and Ismail 2016), which discusses in detail the opportunities and challenges of halal tourism. Still, the focus of the research and the study's concentration is different. In essence, A little study outlines how the halal segment can grow side by side with the conventional types of tourism that have been on the market, on the island of Lombok. Therefore, this study reveals how this

halal tourism campaign emerged as a new segment and whether existing conventional tourism will be marginalized due to the threat of new segments that are believed to have a robust opportunity to develop.

1. Research Background

1.1. Halal Tourism

The attraction of halal tourism reaps positive points. Several studies reveal tourism will continue to increase specifically on entrepreneurship (Fahrurrozi *et al.* 2023). Nationally, the quality of tourism in various countries tends to experience fluctuating conditions. However, Muslim travel reached its highest point in 2019, reaching 160 million (Global Muslim Travel Index 2021), and decreased due to the spread of COVID-19. Halal tourism projections will find a breaking point just as 2019 is estimated in 2024 and will increase until 2028. From the same source, in 2021, Indonesia's position is fourth in halal tourism and must be displaced by the development of halal tourism in Malaysia, Turkey, Saudi Arabia. In addition to improving the quality and capacity of halal tourism in some of these countries, Indonesia has experienced a decline in the quality of halal tourism. However, the quality of halal tourism in Indonesia has improved and gradually increased, occupying the second position after Malaysia (Mastercard-Crescentrating, 2022). The improvement in the quality of Malaysian halal tourism coincides with the increase in studies in the area – the two countries with the best halal tourism (Malaysia and Indonesia) are the largest contributors to the study (Suban *et al.* 2021).

In the context of halal tourism, Indonesia has great potential to develop the industry (Abror *et al.* 2020); From the aspect of climate that offers the beauty of the environment, nature, and culture with the largest number of Muslims in the world with adequate religious facilities to support the needs of halal tourism. Halal commodities are rapidly growing (Adel *et al.* 2021, Al-Kwifi *et al.* 2020, Wingett and Turnbull 2013). The expenditure of Muslim Visitors is expected to increase significantly from US\$140 million in 2018 to US\$230 - US\$300 by the end of 2026; along with a significant increase in the Muslim population (Chianeh *et al.* 2019; Wisker *et al.* 2020).

Supported by the Indonesian population as the majority of Muslims (88% of the total population) is an opportunity welcomed by the Indonesian government. In 2019 Indonesia became Indonesia named the best halal tourist destination in the world and followed by the neighboring country; Malaysia. As a follow-up, the development of halal tourism is planned to continue until 2024 starting from 2019. Furthermore, the Indonesian government targets several areas as halal tourist attractions; West Nusa Tenggara, Aceh, Riau, West Sumatra, Jawab Barat, Yogyakarta, Central Java, Malang Raya, and South Sulawesi.

The development of halal tourism in Indonesia may not reap difficulties as experienced by non-majority Muslim countries in general. Halal means Islamic norms and teachings (Muneeza and Mustapha 2020, Naserirad et al. 2022, Usman et al. 2019), in Indonesia, this is relevant. The basic values of Islam in presentation, tourist services, and tourist activities have referred to Islamic norms. Environment and culture refer to Islamic norms, So, it is not an exaggeration to say worship facilities as a carrying capacity are available almost along tourist destinations. The community well receives activities related to Islam. The support of these aspects is a strong reason to place Indonesia as the best halal tourism nomination. On the contrary, if referred to entirely Islamic norms, it can lead to instability between Muslim and Non-Muslim visitors or discrimination (Battour et al. 2018).

With biological wealth and natural beauty, the majority Muslim population, and with cultural diversity colored by Islamic values, it is not impossible that Indonesia can become the axis of halal tourism. This opportunity must be maximized without compromising aspects of Islamic teachings themselves. However, Indonesia still needs to improve itself in terms of halal tourism. Four criteria are set by the Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI) with their respective weights that can be a reference in improving the quality and capacity of halal tourism, access, communication, environment, and services (Mastercard-Crescentrating 2022). These four points are the main parts that influence the perception of tourist visits (Vargas-Sánchez and Moral-Moral 2019).

Access these criteria cover several important points; visa requirements, connectivity, and transport infrastructures. Accessibility is a strategic area in planning a tourist trip (Yen *et al.* 2021). Security, ease of access in terms of administration, and the availability of air and land transportation that facilitates movement from one place to the intended destination are one of the main considerations (Deng *et al.* 2020).

Communication includes destination marketing, communication proficiency, and stakeholder awareness. Language Mastery supports Muslim Visitor Guide needs and promotional needs, both conventional and digital. Foreign mastery can maximize the use of digital technology, considering that digital promotion is high (Shah *et al.* 2020). This aspect leads to qualified human resources. The readiness of Indonesian people in terms of communication is still dominated by mastery of English, but foreign mastery for local people is still relatively minimal. This is an important criticism for Indonesia, the development of halal tourism is not accompanied by the readiness of market needs. Most halal tourism actors are people from Middle Eastern countries (Harahsheh *et al.*

2019), with those who use Arabic as a social language. On the other hand, the Indonesian people's mastery of Arabic and other foreign languages is far from enough. The GMTI report for 2022 shows that language is the lowest point owned by Indonesia in supporting the needs of halal tourism.

Environment – covers several important points; safety, faith restriction, visitor arrival, enabling climate, and sustainability. Tourism is claimed to be one of the sectors that take part in exacerbating climate change (Ma and Kirilenko 2019) so consideration of environmental aspects is part of the responsibility of halal tourism to restore natural damage and provide safety and comfort in carrying out tourist activities. Tourism leads the environment degradation and increased gas emissions (Wang and Wang 2018); Sustainable halal tourism development is expected to contribute to minimizing the challenges of climate change (Marsiglio 2015), which is a threat to all humankind. Caring for nature, and maintaining peace are part of Islamic norms while maintaining aspects of achieving sustainable development targets. Nevertheless, Indonesia is part of a country that is still struggling with environmental issues.

The last is services that cover important points; core needs (halal food and prayer facilities), core services (hotel and airport), and unique experience. Halal tourism emphasizes products and services based on value and Muslim regulation (Azali *et al.* 2021). Compared to other criteria, GMTI places this last point with the most weight; 40%. The point of service is the most vital criterion of Halal Tourism. If you review the readiness of neighboring countries (Malaysia), in addition to guarantees of adequate accommodation and transportation, the price offered for food needs offered is cheaper than in Indonesia. To increase the number of foreign tourist visits to Indonesia, improving the quality of Muslim-Friendly Facilities, accommodations, safety, and human resources must be a top priority.

1.2. Conventional Tourism

Tourism development goes hand in hand with criticism; environment (Stephen, Boyd, and Boluk 2016), economy (Adedoyin *et al.* 2021), and social and cultural (Veeken *et al.* 2016). The criticism was responded to by efforts to improve, reform, and give birth to new forms of tourism development to protect communities and indigenous and local treasures (Bushell and Bricker 2016). Nature tourism is formed by criticism of environmental damage and a campaign to improve the quality of nature. Community-based tourism was introduced to promote local culture and increase the role of the community in the tourism industry while preventing the fading of local culture, which is increasingly eroded by the times (Lalicic and Garaus 2020, Wang *et al.* 2021). But on the other hand, tourism is used as a qualified source of foreign exchange (Gao and Su 2020). Indonesia, for example, before the spread of COVID-19, the amount of foreign exchange generated from the tourism sector in 2019 exceeded revenues from the oil and gas, coal, and palm oil sectors. Tourism adaptation continues following consumer needs and alignment with other aspects. Tourism sustainable development, culture tourism, and halal tourism are a series of forms of tourism adjustments that are environmentally friendly and meet the needs of people's lives.

Several studies suggest tourism will be increasingly in demand. This encourages various countries to improve the quality of their tourism. Indonesia, for example, the Indonesian government is increasingly aggressively developing tourism with superior program variants and will continue until 2045 development. To attract visitors, the Indonesian government has set 5 destinations as a super-priority, Lake Toba – North Sumatra, Borobudur – Central Java, Mandalika – West Nusa Tenggara, Labuan Bajo – East Nusa Tenggara, Manado, and Likupang – North Sulawesi. Malaysia is taking various strategic steps to develop tourism and positively impact the country's economic development (Islam *et al.* 2020; Shahbaz *et al.* 2018). On the contrary, tourism in Malaysia must deal with terrorism, natural disasters, and COVID-19 (Buigut *et al.* 2021).

However, tourism growth goes hand in hand with challenges. In the pace of the tourism development process in Indonesia, the criticism raised is a serious consideration. Environmental pollution resulted from tourism waste that did not manage well in Indonesia and almost in all parts. The tourism dilemma continues; Infrastructure development to support the needs of tourists is faced with the issue of environmental damage. Furthermore, environmentally friendly infrastructure development technology has not touched this aspect. Meanwhile, tourism demands high-quality facilities (Kamassi *et al.* 2020). Tourism adaptation is a big task for all stakeholders; Adjusting development with ecology, and culture must be prioritized to improve the community's economy.

2. Methodology

This research explains the social phenomena concerning halal tourism on the island of Lombok, West Nusa Tenggara, Indonesia. We chose a qualitative-phenomenological method with the rationale that the representation of halal tourism phenomena campaigned by the province of West Nusa Tenggara answers many things, including

the variety of empirical materials, case studies, and interpretations of social problems with naturalistic characterization settings. The phenomenological research can answer how the halal tourism campaign is carried out, what tourism industries are involved (hotels, restaurants, cafes, destinations), the implementation process, and how to campaign for the halal segment.

Phenomenological studies are applied on the island of Lombok by targeting government officials as important informants providing narratives about halal tourism. The selection of informants with purposive sampling from government officials (tourism office) is appropriate because they are essential authorities who maintain, feel, and run the halal tourism campaign program in the province of West Nusa Tenggara. Video on the halal tourism seminar from the governor of West Nusa Tenggara was then carefully analyzed to support data. Second, they are the most responsible body to explain to the public the essence of halal tourism as a new segment of accommodating Muslim travel but not shifting non-Muslim tourists. Other choices, such as summarizing the opinions of tourism entrepreneurs such as hotel and restaurant managers, are trusted sources. Their capacity to comprehensively explain how hotels or restaurants accommodate the unique needs of Muslim travelers and how non-Muslim visitors respond to the services provided by the accommodation is beneficial. Additional sources were gathered from several travelers, both Muslims and non-Muslims, randomly selected to reinforce the support data collected from key sources such as government officials (tourism agencies) and accommodation managers (hotels and restaurants).

Because the data processing is presented descriptively, the analysis process using the model popularized by Miles & Huberman includes collecting data, reducing data, displaying data, and drawing a conclusion. The data collection process is the first step by collecting data that is the point of study as formulated in the research questions. The source of data collection can be interviewed and reviewed documents. Data reduction is then carried out on the amount of data collected to be filtered because not all the data successfully collected is under the data sought. Critical coding data from interview studies, document reviews, and library research is carried out to be written and presented. The last step of the analysis process is to draw a conclusion containing the research findings.

3. Findings

3.1. Halal Tourism on the Island of Lombok

Halal tourism on the island of Lombok has become a new segment amid the growing tourism; Conventional. Halal tourism began to be proclaimed in the era of the two-term leadership of West Nusa Tenggara Governor Dr. TGB. M. Zainul Madji, Lc,. MA. With the educational background of agama, Muslim scholars, supported by Arabic communication skills, halal tourism opportunities are believed to be a superior product also because the island of Lombok is known as a thousand mosques. Access to networking with an open Middle Eastern community is a supporting factor for the Governor to conduct political lobbying to direct Middle Eastern tourists to look at the island of Lombok as a Muslim-friendly tourist destination where the majority of Middle Eastern tourists spend time visiting the European continent.

West Nusa Tenggara is one of more than 30 provinces in Indonesia proclaiming itself to be a province by offering halal segmentation to tourists. At first, this halal tourism campaign received an unfavorable response from tourism managers on the island of Lombok. They assume that the emergence of halal tourism in the market will have an impact on the weakening of conventional tourism. Halal tourism will kill conventional tourism businesses. This concern received a positive response from the West Nusa Tenggara provincial government. Various dialogue rooms were opened to provide an understanding that halal segmentation is intended to add new tourism features to take advantage of Muslim tourist visits with a lot of spending to other countries. These efforts have yielded results where many hotels register to take advantage of the opportunity of the halal segment as one of the tourism products offered. The following is a summary of TGB's explanation of halal tourism in a seminar entitled halal tourism: "Halal tourism is present as an additional segment that provides more space for tourism business people. Halal tourism does not threaten conventional tourism, on the contrary, it will increase income opportunities because conventional tourism can offer halal tourism features without having to eliminate conventional tourism."

Halal tourism as one of the service industries is a complement to the existing tourism business; conventional tourism. Halal tourism in principle is developed while still prioritizing culture and Muslim values but without compromising the originality of cultural values in the area that is a tourist destination. Halal tourism has the concept of developing Muslim-friendly tourism. This means that there is a guarantee to Muslim tourists that they are getting services that are following religious law without neglecting other conventional tourists who have become markets before. Muslim friendliness is the main principle of halal tourism development. All forms of

accommodation and amenities that offer the concept of halal tourism will fully provide the needs of Muslim tourists for example the practice of providing prayer rooms, holy books, qibla wine, ablution places, and providing 100 percent halal food. Muslim friendly means that tour managers not only facilitate tourists with hospitality but all forms of needs attached to religious creed affairs become the concentration of every halal tourism manager. Thus, halal tourism does not eliminate all elements contained in conventional tourism but is a complement to existing tourism. The target of halal tourism is not only Muslim tourists but attracts non-Muslim tourists. Because in essence, halal tourism is only a complement to conventional types of tourism. As a Muslim-majority country, halal tourism packages should be a strong segment in Indonesia, especially on the island of Lombok. Some considerations such as a thick Islamic culture, the icon of a thousand mosques, and the hospitality of the population are supporting the success of halal tourism on the island of Lombok.

Halal tourism brands on the island of Lombok are increasingly popular based on awards and achievements achieved in several national and international events. In 2015, West Nusa Tenggara has won an award as the best halal destination at the International Halal Travel Summit. This world tourism activity was held in Dubai, the middle east. Not only that, but West Nusa Tenggara has also won awards as Word Best Cultural Destination, World's Best Culinary Destination, and World's Best Halal Honeymoon Destination in the same year. This is certainly a calculation in the global arena and makes the island of Lombok the main destination for world-class tourists. Referring to this, this may be the reason for the increasing number of tourists visits that come to visit, especially from the Middle East market. The halal tourism industry is a great business investment opportunity in every country, not only in Muslim-majority countries but among non-Muslim tourists, into a large market.

Here's a quote from one of the AR speakers: "There is a moment when halal tourism should be a business opportunity for the big tourism industry on the island of Lombok. Several times winning awards in the field of halal tourism should be an opportunity that the halal tourism market will grow and succeed. But at this time, I see that the provincial tourism office does not echo this too much. Many factors can influence, including networking and changes in social and political situations".

West Nusa Tenggara Province develops halal tourism based on the spirit of togetherness and religion of the people in West Nusa Tenggara. Community involvement is important to run a program and ensure that the values of the community are adopted in every aspect of development, especially tourism. Building halal tourism requires commitment from regional leaders and stakeholders to ensure the sustainability of the halal tourism business. The NTB government together with all existing tourism stakeholders built an agreement on halal tourism in terms of policy and budgeting. As a result of the mutual agreement in terms of policy, halal tourism regional regulations (Perda) were born. In terms of budgeting, the Government is committed to using the APBD budget to develop halal tourism by certifying hotels, restaurants, and all forms of service facilities related to halal tourism.

Cross-examination of resource persons during the data collection process concluded that halal tourism features are not an aspect that makes conventional tourism lost and undeveloped. Halal tourism is an additional segment that provides added value or there is a business expansion that tourists can choose without having to bury one of the existing features or packages. Tourism business can expand services which certainly make tourist visits increase both tourists from the Middle East and other parts of Europe. Halal tourism is not only focused on Muslim tourists who visit but services to non-Muslim tourists are considered such as the provision of facilities such as cross-religious holy books such as the Bible and other non-Muslim books at the hotel. This is a calculation that halal tourism does not distinguish Muslim and non-Muslim tourism in any aspect both arrival, service, and how to accommodate every need of tourists. Therefore, the presence of halal tourism does not adversely affect existing conventional tourism but opens up more opportunities for tourism entrepreneurs to increase income because halal tourism is an additional offer that can be consumed at any time.

3.2. Barriers to Halal Tourism Practice on the Island of Lombok

Halal tourism on the island of Lombok had become popular during the era of Dr. K.H. Muhammad Zainul Majdi. However, halal tourism cannot be separated from the challenges that must be passed. First, halal tourism has problems with the regulation of halal certification aspects of accommodation and tourism products such as hotels, restaurants, and cafes that have a Hilal level that needs to be listed and recognized. The following is an excerpt from an interview with one of the AST interviewees.

"The issue of certification of hotels is often a double perception. Some of us still want clarity on what products should be certified. The certifying body is still not 100 percent clear. I think halal certification bodies for our accommodation and restaurants should label them as guidelines for the standards set."

The next obstacle is the perception of the public and managers about halal tourism. There is the most substantive perception claiming that the presence of halal tourism replaces tourism that is already operating. Conventional tourism will be buried because it is no longer accommodated by tourists. Halal tourism will change aspects that already exist in conventional tourism. The acceptance of conventional tourism entrepreneurs assumes that halal tourism brings new rules that all tourism products must be Islamic, have Islamic religious beliefs, and are closely related to Arabization. But on the contrary, halal tourism is expanding services both in accommodation facilities and the needs of Muslim and non-Muslim tourists have been arranged. The lack of public understanding of the conception of halal tourism has an impact on the assumption that there are restrictions on the implementation and prohibitions on old tourism products. In certain cases, such as mosques, there is a requirement for non-Muslim and even Muslim tourists to dress according to religious recommendations. Therefore, the concept of halal tourism is a way to manage tourism objects to meet the primary needs of humans in a worldly and *ukhrawi* manner without limiting other tourism business activities, for example in the context of conventional tourism.

Adequate transportation facilities are still an obstacle in addition to promotional activities. Mode of transportation to destinations that have accommodated halal tourism deficit. The provincial government and related agencies still do not fully provide clear public transport so that it can meet the needs of tourists when they want to visit certain destinations because currently, the majority of tourists use rental cars more expensive than the general mode of transportation.

4. Discussions

The trend of the halal lifestyle has globally touched the needs of the majority Muslim population. Halal lifestyle has encouraged individuals to travel by choosing travel products that can provide answers to their needs (Al-Ansi and Han 2019, Olya and Al-ansi 2018). Psychological needs in the form of material must be guaranteed halal, food that is religiously a dish that does not contradict religious teachings. This principle then becomes an opportunity for tourist destinations to offer halal tourism products.

In some non-Muslim countries such as Korea, Japan, Thailand, and Vietnam, halal segmentation is a successful alternative tourism product. This product service has brought in many Muslim tourists who used to spend the majority of their spending on the European continent. The success of non-Muslim countries in accommodating the needs of Muslim tourists is a significant tourism business achievement (Aratuo *et al.* 2018, Saint Akadiri *et al.* 2019) considering the size of the Muslim tourist market is projected to experience a surge and growth every year. The presence of the halal tourism sector will continue to grow and can be a solution to meet the needs of local communities, for example in employment and reducing unemployment.

In the context of the island of Lombok, the development of halal tourism first, there was resistance from some tourism managers. This challenge is based on the concern of some tourism entrepreneurs that halal tourism will permanently replace the role of conventional tourism. Conventional tourism opportunities are predicted to be destroyed because the echo of halal tourism had become a conversation and choice of many tourists when deciding on a visit. The dilemma did not last long because the provincial government has been actively communicating and providing an understanding that halal tourism is only one additional segment of selected tourism products. Fortunately, halal tourism is not only intended for non-Muslim tourists but can also be accommodated by conventional tourism as long as halal tourism products are provided (Ahmed and Akbaba 2018, Aziz and Athoillah 2019).

In the development of halal tourism on the island of Lombok, there are several obstacles. First, the government must deal with the mindset that halal tourism will eliminate conventional tourism. Halal tourism will not allow conventional tourism that is not under religious guidance. Second, the government has not maximized in campaigning for halal tourism on the island of Lombok. The process of standardization and product certification is often incomplete. The concept of halal does not only apply to tourist destinations (Samori *et al.* 2016) but lodging accommodations are also considered such as Hotels, Restaurants, Cafes, and others. Hotels that implement halal tourism on the island of Lombok have a certification level (hilal) of one to three. These levels have different facilities and types of visitors (tourists). Certification level one (hilal 1) can be visited by anyone, both Muslims and non-Muslims. Certification level two (hilal 2) can still be visited by non-Muslim tourists, but certification level two (hilal 2) has a type of facility that is slightly different from certification level one (hilal 1). While the certification level of the three (hilal 3) types of tourists who enter the hotel is only intended for Muslim tourists because in terms of facilities or in terms of hotel food that has hilal level 3 is not allowed haram food which is prohibited religiously.

In the future, the development of halal tourism on the island of Lombok needs a more rigid campaign. This action provides enlightenment and strengthens the concept to entrepreneurs and the community that halal tourism must be understood holistically. The circulation of issues about halal tourism that will eliminate conventional tourism can be reduced. The process of halal standardization and certification, for example on products that are physical consumption, is further clarified and facilitated by the provincial government so that it will be able to help improve halal tourism to develop on Lombok Island.

Conclusions

The halal tourism campaign in the context of West Nusa Tenggara has caused mixed speculation from tourism business people. Since halal tourism was proclaimed as one of the new segments entering the tourism industry in West Nusa Tenggara, there is an assumption that the introduction of halal tourism will have an impact on killing conventional tourism businesses. Business competition is considered unhealthy considering that halal tourism will fully control the market, limiting conventional business space because the rules used are directly related to Islamic religious principles. The concept of halal tourism is then interpreted as a new segment that displaces existing tourism businesses. The application of Muslim principles as the basis of business practices threatens other tourism businesses because halal tourism practices will use pure Islam which does not allow non-Muslims to consume tourist products. Arabization is allegedly strongly adopted so that it will shift the culture of the existing community. The government through relevant agencies then opens space for tourism business people to dialogue to provide explanations about what and how halal tourism should be developed. With a teamwork pattern, the West Nusa Tenggara Provincial Government has succeeded in convincing conventional tourism business people that halal tourism is beneficial in terms of adding business features that are not only used by non-Muslims but also by the majority of Muslims. Currently, there are dozens of hotels and restaurants in West Nusa Tenggara adopting halal tourism features as a tourist product offered to tourists.

Although halal tourism has opened up potential business opportunities for the community's economic business, some obstacles hinder the acceleration of its practice. Standardization of hotels and restaurants to the halal level needs to be clarified by the certifying body and the clarity of the products certified. The campaign for halal tourism must be done considering that not all tourism business people understand the essence of halal tourism. The assumption that halal tourism displaces conventional tourism harms the image and progress of tourism even though the halal tourism segment was introduced to open additional businesses to encourage better and healthier economic growth of the community. Other obstacles such as the limited mode of transportation as well as the promotion of halal tourism are important obstacles in advancing halal tourism in West Nusa Tenggara (Lombok Island).

Given that halal tourism contributes to the creation of a productive economy in the community, the provincial government through related agencies needs to focus constructive efforts to build this industry. Halal tourism campaigns must be carried out continuously, facilitating a space for dialogue with tourism players, communities, and society. In the future, the government can form an independent institution that specifically takes care of halal tourism certification in addition to MUI. This effort is believed to increase the level of public and consumer confidence in the legality and credibility of halal tourism as an industry.

Acknowledgments

We would like to express our gratitude to our colleagues and university staff who have assisted in administrating this research. The informants (hotel staff, tourism players, managers, host society) who have helped collect data in the field are highly appreciated for their assistance so that this research is carried out as targeted.

Credit Authorship Contribution Statement

Heru Cahyono contributed to compiling research ideas, finding gaps studied and interpreting interview data with resource persons. Muh Fahrurrozi examines the economic phenomenon of the impact of halal tourism in West Nusa Tenggara. He assisted in analyzing and interpreting interview data and drafting papers. Toto Sukarnoto is in charge of compiling research instruments. He is responsible for collecting questions relevant to the data he seeks from sources. He also recorded the number of accommodations and collected information on the capacities of halal principles to be reported in papers. Nursaid is contributing to connecting researchers with resource persons. He is also responsible for selecting relevant literature for the tourism studied.

Declaration of Competing Interest

We declare that we have no conflict of interest in this research with other parties related to funding or that can harm or threaten the results of this academic work.

References

- [1] Abror, A., Patrisia, D., Trinanda, O., Omar, M. W., and Wardi, Y. 2020. Antecedents of Word of Mouth in Muslim-Friendly Tourism Marketing: the Role of Religiosity Word of Mouth. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2020-0006
- [2] Adedoyin, F. F., Seetaram, N., Disegna, M., and Filis, G. 2021. The Effect of Tourism Taxation on International Arrivals to a Small Tourism-Dependent Economy. *Journal of Travel Research* 19(1): 1. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1177/00472875211053658
- [3] Adel, A. M., Dai, X., Yan, C., and Roshdy, R. S. 2021. Halal Strategies on Official Government Tourism Websites: An Extension and Validation Study. *Tourism and Hospitality Research* 21(2): 231. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1177/1467358420986236
- [4] Ahmed, M. J., and Akbaba, A. 2018. The Potential of Halal Tourism in Ethiopia: Opportunities, Challenges and Prospects. *International Journal of Contemporary Tourism Research* 1: 13–22. DOI:https://doi.org/10.30625/ijctr.397499
- [5] Ainin, S., Feizollah, A., Anuar, N. B., and Abdullah, N. A. 2020. Sentiment analyses of multilingual tweets on halal tourism. *Tourism Management Perspectives* 34(February): 100658. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2020.100658
- [6] Akhtar, N., Jin, S., Alvi, T. H., and Siddiqi, U. I. 2020. Conflicting halal attributes at halal restaurants and consumers' responses: The moderating role of religiosity. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management* 45(August): 499–510. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhtm.2020.10.010
- [7] Al-Ansi, A., and Han, H. 2019. Role of halal-friendly destination performances, value, satisfaction, and trust in generating destination image and loyalty. *Journal of Destination Marketing and Management 13*(December 2018): 51–60. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2019.05.007
- [8] Al-Kwifi, O. S., Gelaidan, H. M. H., and Fetais, A. H. M. A. 2020. Identifying the influence of the Halal logo on Muslim consumers' attitudes using fMRI technology. *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 12(6): 1159–1179. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2020-0026
- [9] Aratuo, D. N., Etienne, X. L., Drive, E., Virginia, W., Drive, E., and Virginia, W. 2018. *Industry level Analysis of Tourism-Economic Growth in the United States Ph. D. candidate, Division of Resource Economics and Management, West Virginia University, Assistant Professor, Division of Resource Economics and Management, West Virginia Ind.*
- [10] Azali, M., Basha, N. K., Chang, Y., Lim, X.-J., and Cheah, J. 2021. Why Not Travel to Malaysia? Variations in Inbound Tourists' Perceptions toward Halal- Friendly Destination Attributes. *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Research*, 1–30. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/1096348020987634
- [11] Aziz, N., and Athoillah. 2019. Economic development through halal tourism. *Munich Personal RePEc Archive*, 94834. DOI: https://mpra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/94834/
- [12] Basri, H., Tamrin, M., Alfatwari, D., and Rahadi, I. 2020. Shifting Society in Response to the Tourism Industry: A Case Study of New Challenges in Lombok Utara 4(2): 183–194.
- [13] Battour, M., Hakimian, F., Ismail, M., and Boğan, E. 2018. The perception of non-Muslim tourists towards halal tourism: Evidence from Turkey and Malaysia. *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 9(4): 823–840. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-07-2017-0072
- [14] Battour, M., and Ismail, M. N. 2016. Halal tourism: Concepts, practises, challenges and future. *Tourism Management Perspectives* 19: 150–154. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.008
- [15] Buigut, S., Kapar, B., and Braendle, U. 2021. Effect of Regional Terrorism Events on Malaysian Tourism Demand. *Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 1. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/14673584211021895
- [16] Bushell, R., and Bricker, K. 2016. Tourism in Protected Areas: Developing Meaningful Standards. *Tourism and Hospitality Research* 15(1): 1–2. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/1467358416636173
- [17] Carboni, M., and Idrissi Janati, M. 2016. Halal tourism de facto: A case from Fez. *Tourism Management Perspectives 19*: 155–159. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.007

- [18] Cavallaro, F., Galati, O. I., and Nocera, S. 2017. Policy Strategies for the Mitigation of GHG Emissions caused by the Mass-Tourism Mobility in Coastal Areas. *Transportation Research Procedia* 27: 317–324. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trpro.2017.12.062
- [19] Chianeh, R. H., Kian, B., and Azgoomi, S. K. R. 2019. Islamic And Halal Tourism In Iran: Toward New Horizons. *Bridging Tourism Theory and Practice 10*: 295–307. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1108/S2042-144320190000010018
- [20] Deng, T., Gan, C., and Hu, Y. 2020. Do Hotel Business Benefit from Increased Tourist Accessibility? Evidence from China's High- Speed Railway Program. *Tourism Economics*, 1–18. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1177/1354816620923216
- [21] El-Gohary, H. 2016. Halal tourism, is it really Halal? *Tourism Management Perspectives* 19: 124–130. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.013
- [22] Fahrurrozi, M., Wathoni, H., Basri, H., Mohzana, and Dwimaulani, A. 2023. Entrepreneurial Leadership Values in Tourism Classroom Teaching. Enhancing the Learning Processes for Tourism Business. *Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism* 14(2): 458–468. DOI: https://doi.org/10.14505/jemt.v14.2(66).15
- [23] Gao, Y., and Su, W. 2020. The Disclosure of Quality on Tourism Performance: Evidence from Top Tourist Cities in China. *Journal of Travel Research*, 2, 1. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/0047287520954540
- [24] Global Muslim Travel Index. 2021. Global Muslim Travel Index 2021 (Issue July).
- [25] Groizard, J. L., and Santana-Gallego, M. 2018. The destruction of cultural heritage and international tourism: The case of the Arab countries. *Journal of Cultural Heritage* 33 (January 2019): 285–292. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.culher.2018.06.005
- [26] Harahsheh, S., Haddad, R., and Alshorman, M. 2019. Implications of Marketing Jordan as a Halal Tourism Destination. *Journal of Islamic Marketing, March*, 15. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-02-2018-0036
- [27] Henderson, J. C. 2016. Halal food, certification and halal tourism: Insights from Malaysia and Singapore. *Tourism Management Perspectives* 19: 160–164. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.006
- [28] Islam, M. A., Jantan, A. H., Yusoff, Y. M., Chong, C. W., and Hossain, M. S. 2020. Green Human Resource Management (GHRM) Practices and Millennial Employees' Turnover Intentions in Tourism Industry in Malaysia: Moderating Role of Work Environment. Global Business Review, 3. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/0972150920907000
- [29] Jia, X., and Chaozhi, Z. 2021. Turning impediment into attraction: A supplier perspective on Halal food in non-Islamic destinations. *Journal of Destination Marketing and Management* 19(135): 100517. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2020.100517
- [30] Kamassi, A., Manaf, N. H. A., and Omar, A. 2020. The Need of International Islamic Standards for Medical Tourism Providers: a Malaysian Experience. *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 1. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-03-2019-0051
- [31] Lalicic, L., and Garaus, M. 2020. Tourism-Induced Place Change: The Role of Place Attachment, Emotions, and Tourism Concern in Predicting Supportive or Oppositional Behavioral Responses. *Journal of Travel Research* 12(1): 1. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/0047287520967753
- [32] Ma, S. D., and Kirilenko, A. P. 2019. Climate Change and Tourism in English-Language Newspaper Publications. *Journal of Travel Research 15*(1): 1. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/0047287519839157
- [33] Marsiglio, S. 2015. Economic growth and environment: Tourism as a trigger for green growth. *Tourism Economics* 21(1): 183–204. DOI: https://doi.org/10.5367/te.2014.0411
- [34] Mastercard-Crescentrating. (2022). Global Muslim Travel Index 2022 Report. June, 31–62. https://www.crescentrating.com/download/thankyou.html?file=j-EXWnF4_GMTI_2022_Report_-_FINAL.pdf
- [35] Moshin, A., Brochado, A., and Rodrigues, H. 2020. Halal tourism is traveling fast: Community perceptions and implications. *Journal of Destination Marketing and Management* 18(April): 100503. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2020.100503
- [36] Muneeza, A., and Mustapha, Z. 2020. Need to pioneer Islamic tourism in tourist resorts in Maldives. *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 11(4): 895–916. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2019-0004

- [37] Naserirad, M., Tavakol, M., Abbasi, M., Jannat, B., Sadeghi, N., and Bahemmat, Z. 2022. Predictors of International Muslim Medical Tourists 'Expectations on Halal-Friendly Healthcare Services: A hospital-Based Study. *Health Services Management Research*, 2. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/09514848221109831
- [38] Nurdiansyah, A. 2018. Halal Certification and Its Impact on Tourism in Southeast Asia: A Case Study Halal Tourism in Thailand. *KnE Social Sciences* 3(5): 26. DOI: https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v3i5.2323
- [39] Olya, H. G. T., and Al-ansi, A. 2018. Risk assessment of halal products and services: Implication for tourism industry. *Tourism Management 65*: 279–291. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tourman.2017.10.015
- [40] Pan, S. Y., Gao, M., Kim, H., Shah, K. J., Pei, S. L., and Chiang, P. C. 2018. Advances and challenges in sustainable tourism toward a green economy. *Science of the Total Environment* 635: 452–469. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.04.134
- [41] Qin, D., Xu, H., and Chung, Y. 2019. Perceived impacts of the poverty alleviation tourism policy on the poor in China. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management* 41(September): 41–50. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhtm.2019.09.004
- [42] Ramdani, F., Setiani, P., and Setiawati, D. A. 2019. Analysis of sequence earthquake of Lombok Island, Indonesia. *Progress in Disaster Science* 4: 100046. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pdisas.2019.100046
- [43] Razzaq, S., Hall, C. M., and Prayag, G. 2016. The capacity of New Zealand to accommodate the halal tourism market Or not. *Tourism Management Perspectives* 18: 92–97. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2016.01.008
- [44] Saint Akadiri, S., Alola, A. A., Akadiri, A. C., and Alola, U. V. 2019. Renewable energy consumption in EU-28 countries: Policy toward pollution mitigation and economic sustainability. *Energy Policy* 132: 803–810. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2019.06.040
- [45] Samori, Z., Md Salleh, N. Z., and Khalid, M. M. 2016. Current trends on Halal tourism: Cases on selected Asian countries. *Tourism Management Perspectives* 19: 131–136. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2015.12.011
- [46] Satriana, E. D., and Faridah, H. D. 2018. Halal Tourism: Development, Chance and Challenge. *Journal of Halal Product and Research* 1(2): 32. DOI: https://doi.org/10.20473/jhpr.vol.1-issue.2.32-43
- [47] Shah, S. A. A., Sukmana, R., Fianto, B. A., Ahmad, M. A., Usman, I. U., and Mallah, W. A. 2020. Effects of Halal social media and customer engagement on brand satisfaction of Muslim customer: Exploring the moderation of religiosity. *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 11(6): 1671–1689. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-06-2019-0119
- [48] Shahbaz, M., Benkraiem, R., Miloudi, A., and Tiwari, A. K. 2018. Tourism-Induced Financial Development in Malaysia: New Evidence from the Tourism Development Index. *Tourism Economics*, *January*, 1. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1177/1354816618806123
- [49] Slamet, Abdullah, I., and Laila, N. Q. 2022. The contestation of the meaning of halal tourism. *Heliyon 8*(3). DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e09098
- [50] Suban, S. A., Madhan, K., and Shagirbasha, S. 2021. A bibliometric analysis of Halal and Islamic tourism. Halal and Islamic Tourism, September 9. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1108/IHR-05-2021-0038
- [51] Subarkah, A. R. 2018. Potensi dan Prospek Wisata Halal Dalam Meningkatkan Ekonomi Daerah (Studi Kasus: Nusa Tenggara Barat). *Jurnal Sosial Politik* 4(2): 49. DOI: https://doi.org/10.22219/sospol.v4i2.5979
- [52] Usman, H., Sobari, N., and Sari, L. E. 2019. Sharia motivation in Muslim tourism de fi nition, does it matter? Journal of Islamic Marketing, January, 1759–0833. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2018-0015
- [53] Vargas-sánchez, A., and Moral-Moral, M. 2019. Halal Tourism: Literature Review and Experts' View. *Journal of Islamic Marketing, February*, 4. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-04-2017-0039
- [54] Veeken, S. Van Der, Calgaro, E., Klint, L. M., Law, A., Jiang, M., Lacy, T. De, and Dominey-howes, D. 2016. Tourism Destinations' Vulnerability to Climate Change: Nature-Based Tourism in Vava'u, the Kingdom of Tonga. *Tourism and Hospitality Research*, 16(1:51. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/1467358415611068
- [55] Wang, J., Huang, X., Gong, Z., and Cao, K. 2020. Dynamic assessment of tourism carrying capacity and its impacts on tourism economic growth in urban tourism destinations in China. *Journal of Destination Marketing and Management*. DOI:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2019.100383

- [56] Wang, M., and Wang, C. 2018. Tourism, the Environment, and Energy Policies. *Tourism Economics*, 1–2. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/1354816618781458
- [57] Wang, Z., Yang, P., and Li, D. 2021. The Influence of Heritage Tourism Destination Reputation on Tourist Consumption Behavior: A Case Study of World Cultural Heritage Shaolin Temple. SAGE Open, September, 1–2. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440211030275
- [58] Waryono, W. 2022. The Importance of Halal Tourism Policy in West Sumatera. *Relevance: Journal of Management and Business* 5(1): 60–77. https://ejournal.uinsaid.ac.id/index.php/relevance/article/view/4041%0A https://ejournal.uinsaid.ac.id/index.php/relevance/article/view/4041/1761
- [59] Widagdyo, K. G. (2015). Analisis Pasar Pariwisata Halal Indonesia. *Journal of Tauhidinomics*, 1(1): 73–80.
- [60] Wingett, F., and Turnbull, S. 2013. Halal Holidays: Exploring Expectations of Muslim-friendly holidays. *Journal of Islamic Marketing Article* 4(1): 2013–2014.
- [61] Wisker, Z. Iily, Kadirov, D., and Nizar, J. 2020. Marketing A Destination Brand Image To Muslim Tourists: Does Accessibility To Cultural Needs Matter In Developing Brand Loyalty? *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Research* 20(10): 2. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/1096348020963663
- [62] Yen, H., Chen, P., and Ho, K. 2021. Analyzing Destination Accessibility From the Perspective of Efficiency Among Tourism Origin Countries. SAGE Open 0(0): 1–2. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440211005752
- [63] Yousaf, S., and Xiucheng, F. 2018. Halal Culinary and Tourism Marketing Strategies on Government Websites: A Preliminary Analysis, *School of Management, Fudan University, Shanghai* 1(71750110538): 1–54.



6% Overall Similarity

Top sources found in the following databases:

- 5% Internet database
- Crossref database
- 2% Submitted Works database

- 2% Publications database
- Crossref Posted Content database

TOP SOURCES

The sources with the highest number of matches within the submission. Overlapping sources will not be displayed.

1	journals.aserspublishing.eu Internet	4%
2	Mariame EL KHADAR. "Exploring Factors Shaping Tourist Satisfact Crossref	ion: <1%
3	hrmars.com Internet	<1%
4	School of Business and Management ITB on 2018-08-14 Submitted works	<1%
5	openaccessojs.com Internet	<1%